Sallam Alikum

----- Forwarded Message -----
From: "EnviroProgress@ysu.edu" <EnviroProgress@ysu.edu>
To: aliwadi_77@yahoo.com
Sent: Saturday, November 24, 2012 1:33 AM
Subject: Environmental Progress - Decision on Manuscript ID EP-12-246

23-Nov-2012

Dear Ms. Abbas,

Manuscript ID EP-12-246 entitled "Technical and Economic Analysis of Renewable Energy Powered Stand-alone Pole Street Lights for Remote Area" which you submitted to Environmental Progress, has been reviewed. The comments of the referee(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The referee(s) have recommended publication, but also suggest some minor revisions to your manuscript. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the referee(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.

You can upload your revised manuscript and submit it through your Author Center. Log into http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ep and enter your Author Center, where you will find your manuscript title listed under "Manuscripts with Decisions".

When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments made by the referee(s) in the space provided. You can use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript.

IMPORTANT: We have your original files. When submitting (uploading) your revised manuscript, please delete the file(s) that you wish to replace and then upload the revised file(s).

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to Environmental Progress. I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,

Dr. Martin Abraham
Editor, Environmental Progress
EnviroProgress@ysu.edu

Referee(s)' Comments to Author:

Review Editor
Comments to the Author:
A good manuscript, in need of some minor improvements and updating of data.
Reviewing: 1
Comments to the Author –
1. The data used in fig 3, 4, 5 and 7 were of 2009 which is 3 years old data. Better use recent data to get latest results.
2. In page 9, "In designing a renewable energy system for a SPSL, the required electrical load must first be determined because it has direct impact on its cost, size, and feasibility.” Explanation to this statement were not given.
3. In page 12, "The appropriate value of this variable depends on the current macroeconomic condition, plus additional factors such as: financial strength, implementation and other policy incentives.” Please explain the policy incentives in detail pertaining to Malaysia.
4. Generalized conclusions may be given based on the study for the research community.

Reviewing: 2
Comments to the Author –
The manuscript is well written and it provides a good comparison of the different renewable energy powered systems for pole street lights in remote areas.
The authors write clearly their methodology and results.

The manuscript would be accepted when the authors address the following comments.

1) Pg. 2 Line 53; “an equivalent cost of RM 67.3 million per hour…” An international reader will find useful to see the conversion of RM to US dollars. Please include a parenthesis with the US $ conversion.

2) How many times do you assume to change batteries during the lifetime operation of the Stand-alone Pole Street Lights? It will be useful to show in a sensitivity analysis different scenarios for battery operation (i.e. 1 or 2 batteries per lifetime (zero change), then 1 time change of batteries so total nr. of batteries is 2 or 4 etc…). The results in the sensitivity analysis will include the additional cost for replacing the batteries. How the additional cost for changing batteries will affect the cost of electricity? What happen to the batteries at the end of their life cycle? Are there fees associated with the disposal of the batteries? If so how do they affect the COE for various scenarios?

3) Pg. 12, Line 29. Please correct spelling for word, “selvage” to “salvage”.

4) Table 1. The Prices in USD for each component are for what year of production? Are these for 2010, 2011 or earlier years? How much do you expect these prices to change in the future, let’s say until 2020?

5) Pg. 18, Line 45. The authors provide an important conclusion on the cost of electricity per kWh using the Renewable PV Full-Load model, $1.057/kWh. Please add next to this line the cost of electricity based on the conventional electricity production in country. Illustrate the difference in COE from the different sources, i.e COE from renewable is how much more?