DEMOCRACY:
A COMPARATIVE STUDIES BETWEEN LIBERAL DEMOCRACY AND ISLAMIC POLITICAL SYSTEM

LUKMAN THAIB
BHARUDDIN CHE PA & MOHD ZAIDI ABD RAHMAN

DEPARTMENT OF SIASAH SYAR’IYYAH
ACADEMY OF ISLAMIC STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
2014
DEMOCRACY:
A COMPARATIVE STUDIES BETWEEN LIBERAL DEMOCRACY AND ISLAMIC POLITICAL SYSTEM

LUKMAN THAIB
BHARUDDIN CHE PA & MOHD ZAIDI ABD RAHMAN
UMRG RESEARCH PROJECT NO: RG422-12HNE

DEPARTMENT OF SIASAH SYAR’IYYAH
ACADEMY OF ISLAMIC STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF MALAYA
2014
## CONTENTS

_Democracy: A Comparative Study between Liberal Democracy and Islamic Political Systems_

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreword</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronology</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter One: Discourse On Liberal Democratic Political System</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Meaning of Democracy</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy from the Perspectives of World Civilizations:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in Middle East</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in Ancient China</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in Ancient India</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in Ancient Greece</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in Italian-City Republic</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in England (The Levellers)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in the American Revolution</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in the French Revolution</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy in Post-French Revolution</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historical Development of Democracy as System of Government</strong></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Types of Democracy as Systems of Governance</strong></td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Development of Democratic Idea and Institution in the West:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Evolution of Direct Democracy</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Constitution During /After World War I</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Constitution in the Nineteenth Century (Up to World War II):</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambivalences in France</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland and the United States of America</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutions and Constitutional Reform after World War II</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restoration of Democracy after Dictatorial Regimes</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constituting Democracy after Communism (1989)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reforming Power Structure in a Democracy: The Case of Italy.................................................................32
State Affiliation and Independence.................................................................34
Transfer of Sovereignty..................................................................................33
Moral Values.................................................................................................34
Liberal Democracy in the Evolution of Democracy........................................34

**The Main Characteristic of Western Liberal Democracy:**

- Widespread political participation.........................................................37
- Frequent regular elections........................................................................37
- Broad freedom of individuals.....................................................................37
- Government that can alter, interpret and enforce laws...............................37
- Effective guarantees of individual and minority rights...............................37
- Limited governmental powers....................................................................37

**Four Defining Structural Features of Liberal Democracy:**

- Stateness.....................................................................................................37
- Rule of law.....................................................................................................39
- Democracies organise political competition...............................................40
- Accountability...............................................................................................42

**Values of Democracy:**

- Freedom.......................................................................................................43
- Equality..........................................................................................................43
- Accountability.................................................................................................43
- Fairness...........................................................................................................43
- Openness........................................................................................................44
- Transparency................................................................................................44
- Trust................................................................................................................44

**Contemporary Institutions for Liberal Democracy in the West**..................44

The Role of Political Institution......................................................................44
The Institutions of Western Liberal Democratic States...................................45
The Legislature...............................................................................................46
The Organisation of the Legislature: Unicameral and Bicameral.....................46
Function of the Legislature............................................................................47
Legislature in an Islamic System......................................................................51
The Executive..................................................................................................51
Who are the Executives?...............................................................................51
Chapter Two: Comparative Studies between the Main Elements of Western Liberal Democracy and Islamic Political System

Islam and the Concept of Popular Sovereignty (al-Hakimiyyah) .......................................................... 62

Islamic Point of View on the Civil Liberty:

Definition of Civil Liberty ............................................................................................................... 64
Civil Liberty and Country Constitution .......................................................................................... 66
Historical Precedent of the Civil Liberty ...................................................................................... 66
Sources of Civil Liberties in the Liberal Democratic Country ....................................................... 67
Component of the Western Civil Liberties ..................................................................................... 68
The Brief History of Freedom in Islamic Thought ........................................................................... 72
Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................ 76

The Principle of Majority rule (al-Hukm al-Aghlabiyyah) as a Decision-Making Mechanism in Islam .................................................................................................................................................. 77

How Islam View the Elected Representatives Institution?

Definition of Representation ........................................................................................................... 78
Function of Representation ............................................................................................................. 79
The Islamic Rationality on the Elected Representatives ..................................................................... 80
Islamic Legal Reasons ..................................................................................................................... 80
Islamic Legal Sources .................................................................................................................... 82
Ijma’ as Basis for Political Representation ..................................................................................... 82
The Rule of Wajib as a Basis for Political Representation ................................................................. 83

The Principle of Separation of Powers in Islam ............................................................................. 84

The Islamic Perspective on Separation of Powers ......................................................................... 85
The Islamic Concept of Separation of Power ............................................................................... 86
The Islamic state under the maxim of separation of powers ........................................................... 89
The Islamic lenient concept of separation of power: “The Cooperation between The Three Branches” ......................................................................................................................................................... 89
Political Participation According to Islamic Point of View ................................................................. 91
The Basis of Political Participation ......................................................................................................... 92

Islam and The Competitive Election:
What is Election? ................................................................................................................................. 93
Election in Liberal Democracy ............................................................................................................... 93
Types and Functions of Elections ......................................................................................................... 94
Election’s Practices from Islamic Point of View ....................................................................................... 95
Precedent from Human Experience ..................................................................................................... 96
Islamic Legal Maxim on Popular Election ............................................................................................ 97

The Formation of Islamic Political Party in Islamic Political Thought:
Historical Background on the Emergent of Political Party ................................................................. 97
Definition of Political Parties ............................................................................................................... 98
The Importance of Political Parties ....................................................................................................... 99
Functions of Political Parties ............................................................................................................... 100
Islamic Rationality on the Existence of Political Parties ..................................................................... 100
The Rationality on the Establishment Political Party in Islamic Thought ............................................. 102
The Evidence the command is for Political Parties .......................................................................... 103
Political Party as Instrument for Implementation of Shari’ah ................................................................ 103

Chapter Three: Comparative between Western Liberal Democracy and Islamic Political System .................. 106
Conclusion .............................................................................................................................................. 108
References ............................................................................................................................................ 109